NOVARA
CONSULTING GROUP

This document was translated from English by machine and may contain mistakes. The English original is at https://www.novaracg.com/2025/05/18/skills-not-keywords-inference-auditability-and-the-claims-employers-should-not-make/.

Kev Txawj Ntse, Tsis Yog Cov Lus Tshawb: Kev Xam Pom, Kev Tshuaj Xyuas, thiab Cov Lus Nqes Zog Cov Tswv Hauj Lwm Tsis Txhob Hais

Heather Grizzle · May 18, 2025

Kev muab AI skills inference los hloov cov keyword filters tsis tau tshem cov proxies tawm. Nws tsuas yog tsub lawv mus rau qhov chaw uas tus tswv hauj lwm tsis muaj peev xwm tshuaj xyuas tau, thiab tsim kom tus nra pov thawj hnyav zog tuaj.

Cov Ntsiab Lus

1. Kev thov
2. Tej yam pov thawj qhia txog qhov kev coj ua
3. Kev kwv yees tsis tau tshem tawm qhov sawv cev
4. Cov npe kev txawj yog ib qho tsim tawm, thiab muaj leej twg tsim nws
5. Ib qho cuab yeej tshuaj xyuas tau hloov mus rau qhov tsis pom meej
6. Kev npaj raws li kev txawj ua rau qhov xav tau kev txheeb xyuas nce siab, tsis yog txo qis
7. Kev thov tsis txhob hais
8. Yam yuav tsum tsim ua ntej siv
9. Kev xaus
10. Cov chaw siv

Kev thov

Kev thov loj tshaj plaws uas tam sim no muab rau nrog cov cuab yeej kev txawj ntse (AI) hauv kev ntiav neeg ua haujlwm yog tias nws pub kom ntiav neeg raws li kev

txawj ua haujlwm es tsis yog raws li lo lus tseem ceeb, thiab qhov kev ua li ntawd ua rau muaj cov tswv yim ncaj ncees dua, muaj kev nkag mus loj dua, thiab muaj pab neeg sib txawv ntau dua. Nws yog qhov kev thov muaj zog tshaj ntawm cov kev thov uas muaj, vim tias, tsis zoo li kev thov txog kev ua haujlwm zoo lossis kev koom tes, nws qhia tau qhov teeb meem tiag tiag hauv yam khoom uas nws xav hloov.

All of that is true, and it does not establish that the replacement is an improvement in the respects claimed. Novara Consulting Group's position is that the substitution of inferred skills for matched keywords changes the character of the instrument in ways that matter for governance, that most of those changes make the employer's position harder rather than easier to defend, and that one of the claims routinely attached to it should not be made in public at all.

Tej yam pov thawj qhia txog qhov kev coj ua

Ua ntej kawm txog thev naus laus zis, nws tsim nyog qhia txog seb yam tiag tiag tau tshwm sim qhov twg cov koomhaum siv kev ntiav neeg ua haujlwm raws li kev txawj ua ib txoj cai.

In February 2024 the Harvard Business School Project on Managing the Future of Work and the Burning Glass Institute published a study of 11,300 roles at large firms, examining hiring at least one year before and after degree requirements were removed. Dropping the requirement produced an average increase of roughly 3.5 percentage points in the hiring of workers without a bachelor's degree, and because the change applied only to the small share of roles that dropped a requirement, the net effect across the labor market amounted to fewer than one in seven hundred hires. Close to half the firms studied fell into a category the authors termed in name only, where a stated commitment produced no measurable change in hiring behavior.

LOS NTAWM COV LEJ

11,300

cov haujlwm hauv cov tuam txhab loj uas tau tshuaj xyuas ua ntej thiab tom qab tshem tawm cov kev xav tau degree

3.5 pp
qhov nce nruab nrab ntawm kev ntiav cov neeg ua hauj lwm uas tsis muaj bachelor′s degree

"~50%"
"ntawm

Chaw taw qhia: Fuller thiab lwm tus, Skills-Based Hiring: The Long Road from Pronouncements to Practice, Lub Ob Hlis 2024

Qhov kev pom tsis yog tias kev ntiav neeg raws li kev txawj ua tsis tau. Cov tuam txhab uas hloov lawv txoj kev ua haujlwm tsis yog tsuas hloov cov ntawv tshaj tawm xwb, tau pom qhov hloov pauv tiag tiag. Qhov kev pom yog tias kev tshaj tawm thiab kev coj ua sib txawv heev, thiab qhov sib txawv ntawd tsis tau raug pom vim tsis muaj leej twg tau ntsuas qhov thib ob. Ib lub koomhaum uas npaj siv txoj kev no yuav tsum xav tias nws tus kheej cov txiaj ntsig yuav zoo ib yam li qhov nruab nrab tshwj tsis yog nws ntsuas, thiab yuav tsum saib qhov sib txawv ntawm yam nws hais thiab yam nws cov ntaub ntawv ntiav neeg qhia yog yam yuav tshwm sim tau ntau tshaj plaws hauv kev sib cav yav tom ntej.

Kev kwv yees tsis tau tshem tawm qhov sawv cev

Kev thov txog thev naus laus zis yog tias ib qho qauv kev txawj ua tau nyeem dhau lo lus sab nraud mus rau qhov kev txawj tiag tiag. Yam nws ua tiag tiag yog tsim cov kev

muab kev txawj los ntawm tib phau ntawv uas cov lo lus tseem ceeb tau nyeem, siv ib txoj kev sib txuas ntev dua thiab yooj yim tsawg dua rau kev tshuaj xyuas.

Tus qauv tsis pom tias ib tug neeg thov haujlwm muaj peev xwm tswj hwm ib qho project. Nws pom lub npe haujlwm, ntawm ib tus tswv haujlwm, rau ntev npaum li cas, piav qhia hauv lo lus tshwj xeeb, thiab muab ib qho kev txawj raws li kev sib txuas kawm los ntawm cov ntaub ntawv yav dhau los txog yam neeg tuav npe zoo sib xws ntawm cov tswv haujlwm zoo sib xws raug xav tias muaj peev xwm ua tau. Txhua qhov sawv cev uas cov lo lus tseem ceeb muaj tseem muaj rau tus qauv kwv yees, thiab muaj ntau qho ntxiv tshwm sim, vim tus qauv muaj peev xwm rho tau los ntawm koom haum meej mom, kev ua haujlwm ncaj ncees, txoj kev hais lus, thiab cov qauv kev nce qib uas ib daim ntawv teev lo lus tsis muaj peev xwm sawv cev tau.

Qhov no tseem ceeb tshaj rau cov neeg thov haujlwm uas txoj hauv kev no npaj yuav mus txog. Kev txawj tau txais los ntawm kev saib xyuas menyuam, kev koom tes hauv zej zog, kev ua haujlwm hauv tub rog, kev lag luam tsis raug cai lossis hauv tsev neeg, kev tswj hwm tus kheej thaum muaj kev tsis taus, lossis ib txoj haujlwm raug cais tawm, yog cov kev txawj uas tsis tau muaj sawv cev zoo hauv cov ntaub ntawv kawm uas tau muab los ntawm keeb kwm ua haujlwm ib txwm. Tus neeg thov haujlwm uas nws txoj kev txawj tsis pom meej hauv cov ntaub ntawv ib txwm siv raug txo nqi los ntawm lo lus tseem ceeb thiab tseem raug txo nqi los ntawm tus qauv, tsuas yog qhov sib txawv yog nws tsis pom tau lawm vim li cas.

Tus neeg thov haujlwm uas nws txoj kev txawj tsis pom meej hauv cov ntaub ntawv ib txwm siv raug txo nqi los ntawm lo lus tseem ceeb thiab tseem raug txo nqi los ntawm tus qauv, tsuas yog qhov sib txawv yog nws tsis pom tau lawm vim li cas.

Cov npe kev txawj yog ib qho tsim tawm, thiab muaj leej twg tsim nws

Txhua qhov kev ua haujlwm raws li kev txawj nyob ntawm ib qho npe kev txawj: ib pawg kev txawj teev npe tseg, lawv cov ntsiab lus, lawv txoj kev sib raug zoo, thiab cov pov thawj uas raug xav tias qhia txog txhua yam. Cov npe kev txawj ntawd tsis yog ib

yam khoom ntawm keej. Nws raug tsim los ntawm neeg, sau cov kev txiav txim txog yam suav tias yog kev txawj, cov kev txawj twg sib txawv ntawm ib leeg, thiab yam qhia tias muaj tus kheej.

Organizations adopting these systems almost never examine the taxonomy, and in many products cannot. The result is that the definition of qualification for a role has been outsourced to a vendor's ontology, and the employer using it will nonetheless be the party asked to justify it. When the question arrives asking why a particular attribute was treated as required, the answer that it was in the vendor's skills library is not responsive.

Ib qho cuab yeej tshuaj xyuas tau hloov mus rau qhov tsis pom meej

Qhov no yog qhov kev tswj hwm thiab yog qhov feem coob raug hnov tsis pom.

Ib qho kev nrhiav lo lus tseem ceeb yog ib qho cuab yeej tsis zoo nrog ib qho zoo tseem ceeb: nws pom meej. Cov npe muaj peev xwm nyeem tau. Ib tug neeg muaj peev xwm saib nws thiab pom tias qhov nrhiav yuav tsum tau muaj ib lo lus uas tsis muaj feem xyuam nrog txoj haujlwm, lossis nws cais tawm ib lo lus zoo sib xws uas siv ntau hauv ib qho kev lag luam lossis thaj chaw. Qhov chaw nws tsim kev cuam tshuam tsis zoo, tus khoom uas ua rau muaj feem, tuaj yeem nrhiav tau, vim cov khoom raug teev npe.

Ib tus qauv kwv yees kev txawj tsis muaj ob qho zoo li ntawd. Nws cov qauv txiav txim tsis muaj peev xwm nyeem tau, nws cov khoom tsis muaj peev xwm raug tshuaj xyuas ib qho ib qho los ntawm tus tswv haujlwm, thiab qhov laj thawj ua rau ib tug neeg thov haujlwm tau qhab nia li cas tsis tuaj yeem nrhiav tau los ntawm ib yam dab tsi tus tswv haujlwm muaj. Lub koomhaum tau hloov ib qho cuab yeej yooj yim pom meej mus rau ib qho tsib tsib tsis pom meej thiab piav qhia qhov kev hloov pauv ua ib qho kev txhim kho hauv kev ncaj ncees. Yam nws txhim kho yog kev tsib tsib. Yam nws muab tso tseg yog tib yam uas ua rau tus cuab yeej yav tas los tiv thaiv tau.

Qhov no muaj kev cuam tshuam ncaj qha rau hauv txoj cai tsoom fwv uas twb muaj lawm. Cov Uniform Guidelines on Employee Selection Procedures xav kom qhov chaw uas ib txoj kev xaiv tag nrho qhia tias muaj kev cuam tshuam tsis zoo, tus siv yuav tsum qhia tau seb yam khoom twg nqa qhov ntawd thiab tswj cov pov thawj txog kev siv tau rau cov khoom ntawd. Ib txoj kev tsim los ntawm ib qho kev nrhiav teev npe

tseg pub tau kev tshuaj xyuas ntawd. Ib txoj kev tsim los ntawm ib tus qauv kwv yees, nyob rau tus tuam txhab muag khoom cov cuab yeej, cov qhab nia raug muab pov tseg tom qab kev txheeb xyuas, feem ntau ua tsis tau.

Kev npaj raws li kev txawj ua rau qhov xav tau kev txheeb xyuas nce siab, tsis yog txo qis

Muaj ib qho kev cuam tshuam ntxiv uas cov koomhaum siv cov lo lus no tsis tau xav txog.

Ib qho kev nrhiav lo lus tseem ceeb tsis hais tias nws ntsuas dab tsi. Nws tsuas sib txuas cov ntawv sau. Ib qho kev ua haujlwm raws li kev txawj hais qhia meej: tias nws ntsuas cov kev txawj uas raug txheeb xyuas thiab muaj feem xyuam rau haujlwm. Qhov kev hais qhia ntawd yog ib qho kev thov txog construct validity, uas tus tswv haujlwm hais, tab meeg rau pej xeem, txog nws tus kheej txoj kev xaiv neeg.

Raws li Uniform Guidelines, ib tus tswv haujlwm uas nws txoj kev xaiv neeg tsim kev cuam tshuam tsis zoo yuav tsum muab pov thawj tias txoj kev ntawd siv tau rau txoj haujlwm ntawd. Ib tus tswv haujlwm uas tau piav qhia rau pej xeem tias nws txoj kev ua haujlwm ntsuas cov kev txawj tshwj xeeb uas muaj feem xyuam rau haujlwm tau nqa txoj kev txiav txim uas nws yuav raug ntsuas ua ntej txawm nws tseem tsis tau ua kom tau raws li ntawd. Yog li ntawd, lub koomhaum yuav tsum muaj peev xwm teb tau, rau txhua qhov khoom raug ntsuas, seb nws sib raug zoo nrog dab tsi hauj lwm raug sau tseg, thiab raws li pov thawj twg qhov sib raug zoo ntawd nyob. Qhov chaw uas kev teb yog tus tuam txhab muag khoom hu npe rau kev txawj ntawd, tus tswv haujlwm tau lees txais ib qho kev thov txog kev siv tau uas nws tsis tau hais thiab tiv thaiv tsis tau.

Kev thov tsis txhob hais

Ib qho kev hais qhia uas nquag muab nrog kev ntiav neeg raws li kev txawj yuav tsum raug tshem tawm ntawm txhua qhov kev sib txuas lus sab nraud: tias txoj hauv kev no tsim cov pab neeg sib txawv ntau dua.

The difficulty is not that diversity is an improper goal. It is that the sentence, read by a lawyer, states that the organization's selection process affects the protected-class composition of its workforce. Title VII, as amended in 1991, makes it unlawful in connection with the selection or referral of applicants to adjust scores, use different

cutoff scores, or otherwise alter the results of employment-related tests on the basis of race, color, religion, sex, or national origin. Nothing here suggests that skills-based tools do this. What the public claim does is invite the question, in a document the employer wrote and cannot retract, in an environment where such questions are being asked with increasing frequency and where Executive Order 14281 has directed federal agencies to deprioritize disparate impact enforcement while doing nothing to reduce the exposure of employers who make affirmative representations about demographic outcomes.

Tseem muaj qhov teeb meem ib txwm ntawm kev muab pov thawj. Ib lub koomhaum uas hais tias nws txoj kev ua haujlwm tsim cov pab neeg sib txawv ntau dua yuav tsum muaj peev xwm muab cov ntaub ntawv ua ntej thiab tom qab uas txhawb nqa nws, tswj hwm raws li cov neeg thov haujlwm cov pawg thiab kev ntiav neeg coob npaum li cas. Feem coob ua tsis tau, uas txhais tau tias qhov kev thov tsis tau raug tshuaj xyuas thiab tsis tsim nyog.

> **TXOJ KEV HAIS UAS TIV THAIV TAU**
>
> Lub koomhaum tab tom nthuav dav cov kev tsim nyog nws yuav xav txog, tau sau cov ntsiab lus muaj feem xyuam rau haujlwm rau txhua qho, thiab saib xyuas cov txiaj ntsig. Kab lus ntawd yog qhov tseeb, mus raws li lub hom phiaj, thiab tsis hais dab tsi lub koomhaum yuav tsis xav kom raug nug muab pov thawj.

Txoj kev hais uas tiv thaiv tau muaj thiab tsis siv nqi dab tsi. Lub koomhaum tab tom nthuav dav cov kev tsim nyog nws yuav xav txog, tau sau cov ntsiab lus muaj feem xyuam rau haujlwm rau txhua qho, thiab saib xyuas cov txiaj ntsig. Kab lus ntawd yog qhov tseeb, mus raws li lub hom phiaj, thiab tsis hais dab tsi lub koomhaum yuav tsis xav kom raug nug muab pov thawj.

Yam yuav tsum tsim ua ntej siv

Tsib yam, uas muaj peev xwm teb tau ua ntawv thiab los ntawm pov thawj tsis yog los ntawm tus tuam txhab muag khoom cov lus piav qhia, ua ntej ib qho kev ua haujlwm kwv yees kev txawj kov txog ib qho kev txiav txim xaiv neeg.

1. **What is the taxonomy, who built it, and can the organization read it.** A system whose skill definitions cannot be inspected has placed the definition of qualification outside the organization′s control while leaving the justification inside it.
2. **Rau txhua qho khoom raug ntsuas, nws sib raug zoo nrog dab tsi hauj lwm raug sau tseg.** Qhov no yuav tsum raug sau los ntawm lub koomhaum, tsis yog los ntawm tus tuam txhab muag khoom, thiab nws yuav tsum muaj ua ntej tus qauv khiav tsis yog tom qab ib qho kev foob raug ntaus.
3. **Puas yog qhab nia, cov khoom siv, thiab tus qauv version raug khaws cia rau txhua qho kev txiav txim, thiab puas muaj peev xwm rov ua tau ib qho kev txiav txim tshwj xeeb tom qab.** Yog tsis tau, lub koomhaum ua tsis tau qhov kev tshuaj xyuas khoom uas Uniform Guidelines xav tau, thiab yuav tsum paub qhov ntawd ua ntej nws xav tau nws.
4. **What does the organization′s own hiring data show, measured before and after.** Given the published gap between pronouncement and practice, this is the only way to know whether anything changed, and it is also the record that establishes good faith.
5. **Lub koomhaum hais dab tsi rau pej xeem, thiab nws puas muaj peev xwm muab pov thawj rau txhua kab lus.** Cov ntawv tshaj tawm kev lag luam txog cov txiaj ntsig ntiav neeg yeej tuaj yeem nrhiav tau, thiab nws raug sau los ntawm cov neeg uas tsis raug nug thaum nws raug tsim tawm tom qab.

Kev xaus

Ntiav neeg raws li kev txawj ntse es tsis yog raws li lo lus tseem ceeb yog ib lub hom phiaj zoo, thiab qhov kev thuam txog kev sib piv lo lus tseem ceeb uas ua rau muaj lub hom phiaj no yeej raug. Qhov uas cov thev naus laus zis tam sim no muab tsis yog

qhov tshem tawm cov proxy tab sis yog kev tsiv cov proxy ntawd mus rau ib theem uas tus tswv hauj lwm tsis tuaj yeem tshuaj xyuas tau, nrog kev hais tawm hauv pej xeem txog qhov tseeb ntawm tus qauv tsim uas tus tswv hauj lwm tsis tau ua kom pom tseeb, thiab ib qho lus hais txog cov txiaj ntsig raws haiv neeg uas nws yuav zoo dua yog tsis hais li ntawd.

Cov koom haum uas yuav tau txais txiaj ntsig los ntawm qhov kev hloov pauv no yog cov uas suav nws ua ib qho teeb meem ntsuas tsis yog ib qho kev txiav txim siab yuav khoom: cov uas txhais cov kev txawj ntse ntawd tus kheej, sau tseg qhov chaw hais txog kev cuam tshuam nrog haujlwm, tuav cia cov ntaub ntawv, ntsuas seb muaj dab tsi hloov tiag tiag, thiab piav qhia qhov tshwm sim ua lus uas lawv yuav tiv thaiv tau hauv tsev hais plaub. Qhov ntawd yog kev ua hauj lwm ntau dua li kev txais yuav cov lo lus siv. Nws kuj yog tib hom kev ntiav neeg raws li kev txawj ntse uas tau qhia tias muaj peev xwm hloov ib yam dab tsi tiag.

Cov chaw siv

- Executive Order 14281, Kev Rov Qab Ua Kom Muaj Kev Sib Luag Ntawm Kev Muaj Sijhawm thiab Kev Ntseeg Raws Li Kev Tsim Nyog, Lub Plaub Hlis 23, 2025.
- Fuller, Joseph, et al. *Skills-Based Hiring: The Long Road from Pronouncements to Practice*. Harvard Business School Project on Managing the Future of Work thiab The Burning Glass Institute, Lub Ob Hlis 2024.
- Title VII ntawm Civil Rights Act of 1964, raws li tau hloov kho, 42 U.S.C. § 2000e-2, suav nrog § 2000e-2(l).
- Cov Kev Qhia Ib Yam Txog Txheej Txheem Xaiv Neeg Ua Hauj Lwm, 29 C.F.R. Part 1607, suav nrog §§ 1607.4 thiab 1607.15; cov cai tuav ntaub ntawv ntawm EEOC, 29 C.F.R. Part 1602.

TIPS

Know something about a sign language AI system that the public should know? Send it to tips@novaracg.com. Every tip is read by me and kept confidential. If you work in the UK, writing to us is not by itself a protected disclosure under the Public Interest Disclosure Act 1998, so before you share employer information, check your options with Protect (protect-advice.org.uk), the free whistleblowing advice line.

Yuav Hais Qhov Chaw Li Cas

Grizzle, H. M. (2025, May 18). Kev Txawj Ntse, Tsis Yog Cov Lus Tshawb: Kev Xam Pom, Kev Tshuaj Xyuas, thiab Cov Lus Nqes Zog Cov Tswv Hauj Lwm Tsis Txhob Hais. Novara Consulting Group. https://www.novaracg.com/hmn/2025/05/18/skills-not-keywords-inference-auditability-and-the-claims-employers-should-not-make/