NOVARA
CONSULTING GROUP

This document was translated from English by machine and may contain mistakes. The English original is at https://www.novaracg.com/2025/05/23/four-numbers-and-no-counterfactual-reading-the-artificial-intelligence-case-study-in-human-resources/.

Plaub Xoom Thiab Tsis Muaj Kev Sib Piv: Kev Nyeem Zaj Kawm Txog Artificial Intelligence Hauv Human Resources

Heather Grizzle · May 23, 2025

Plaub qhov kev nce ntawm feem pua thiab tsis muaj counterfactual. Yam txhua qhov ntsuas hauv cov ntawv tshuaj xyuas HR AI qauv yuav tsum muaj tseeb, thiab cov lus nug uas siv sijhawm kaum feeb.

Cov Ntsiab Lus

1. Hom kev sau
2. Kev thov ib: kev txo qis ntawm sij hawm siv ntawm kev ntiav ua haujlwm (time-to-fill)
3. Kev thov ob: kev txo qis ntawm kev ua haujlwm ntawm tes uas tsis siv computer (manual transactional activity)
4. Kev thov peb: kev nce ntawm cov neeg muaj peev xwm siab tsis tawm haujlwm (high-potential retention)
5. Kev thov plaub: kev txo bias
6. Yam tsis muaj hauv tag nrho plaub qho
7. Vim li cas tus thov feem ntau ntseeg
8. Yam ib tus neeg yuav khoom yuav tsum nug
9. Yam uas ib qho kev tshawb fawb (case study) muaj ntseeg tau yuav tsim nyog muaj
10. Kev xaus
11. Cov chaw siv

Kev tshawb fawb rau tsav ntawm kev siv artificial intelligence hauv human resources tau txawj txaus los ua ib qho qauv ruaj khov.

Hom kev sau

Kev tshawb fawb rau tsav ntawm kev siv artificial intelligence hauv human resources tau txawj txaus los ua ib qho qauv ruaj khov. Ib lub koom haum piav qhia txog ib qho kev siv, tshaj tawm peb los plaub feem pua kev txhim kho, ntxiv ib qho lus hais txog kev txo bias, thiab xaus tias cov neeg ua haujlwm tau los ua ib qho hauv paus kev sib tw. Cov lej tshwj xeeb. Txoj kev tshawb fawb tsis muaj. Qhov xaus caw ib qho kev sib tham.

Cov qauv sau no nyob mus li vim nws ua haujlwm zoo li kev qhia txaus siab thiab vim tsis muaj leej twg nyob rau qhov chaw yuav tuaj xyuas nws. Cov neeg muag khoom luam tawm nws vim nws muag tau. Cov neeg ua haujlwm luam tawm nws vim nws tsim kev ntseeg siab. Cov neeg yuav lees yuav vim lwm txoj kev yog lees paub tias lawv tsis muaj hauv paus rau txoj kev txiav txim uas lawv yuav ua. Txhua tus hauv txoj kab no muaj txoj kev cuab yeej rau tus lej thiab tsis muaj leej twg muaj txoj kev cuab yeej rau tus lej hauv qab (denominator).

Novara Consulting Group's position is that these documents should be read as advertising claims rather than as evidence, that the specific figures most often cited are the ones most easily produced without any underlying improvement, and that a buyer capable of asking four questions can distinguish a real result from a reported one in about ten minutes. What follows is that method, applied to the four claims that appear most frequently.

Txhua tus hauv txoj kab no muaj txoj kev cuab yeej rau tus lej thiab tsis muaj leej twg muaj txoj kev cuab yeej rau tus lej hauv qab (denominator).

Kev thov ib: kev txo qis ntawm sij hawm siv ntawm kev ntiav ua haujlwm (time-to-fill)

Time-to-fill yog qhov kev ntsuas uas raug tshaj tawm ntau tshaj plaws thiab yooj yim tshaj plaws yuav txav yam tsis hloov dab tsi txog kev ntiav ua haujlwm.

Kev ntsuas no yuav tsum muaj ib qho chaw pib txhais tseg thiab ib qho chaw xaus txhais tseg, khaws cia tsis hloov thoob plaws lub sij hawm sib piv. Hauv txoj kev ua tiag qhov chaw pib txawv ntawm txhua lub koom haum thiab feem ntau ntawm txhua qhov kev thov ntiav (requisition): nws tej zaum yog hnub uas kev thov ntiav raug pom zoo, hnub uas nws raug tshaj tawm, hnub uas kev nrhiav neeg pib, los sis hnub uas tus thawj coj ntiav ua haujlwm thawj zaug hais txog qhov xav tau. Txav qhov chaw pib mus rau tom qab ua rau lub sij hawm ntsuas luv dua yam tsis luv dua ib yam dab tsi uas leej twg raug ntsib. Zoo ib yam li kev tshem tawm cov kev thov ntiav uas raug thim los sis rho tawm, tshem tawm cov haujlwm uas siv sij hawm ntau tshaj plaws, los sis hloov cov haujlwm sib xyaw hauv tus lej hauv qab.

Qhov kev cuam tshuam loj dua qhov cuam tshuam tiag. Time-to-fill teb rau xam txog xwm txheej kev ua haujlwm heev, thiab lub sij hawm sib piv tseem ceeb rau feem ntau cov kev tshawb fawb tam sim no yog thaum hloov ntawm kev tsis muaj neeg ua haujlwm txaus mus rau xwm txheej uas nyob ywj siab dua. Ib lub koom haum uas tsis hloov dab tsi yuav tau qhia kev txhim kho thoob plaws lub sij hawm ntawd. Kev muab qhov hloov no rau ib qho kev siv uas tau siv rau lub sij hawm ntawd yuav tsum muaj ib qho counterfactual, thiab tsis muaj ib qho kev tshawb fawb hauv hom no muaj ib qho.

Lo lus qualifier tsim nyog tau txais kev saib xyuas thiab. Kev txhim kho uas raug tshaj tawm rau cov haujlwm tseem ceeb tsis yog rau txhua txoj haujlwm qhia txog ib qho subset, thiab qhov chaw uas subset raug xaiv tom qab paub tseeb qhov tshwm sim, tus lej piav txog kev xaiv tsis yog piav txog qauv.

Kev thov ob: kev txo qis ntawm kev ua haujlwm ntawm tes uas tsis siv computer (manual transactional activity)

Kev thov no yuav tsum muaj ib qho kev ntsuas hauv paus ntawm kev ua haujlwm ntawm tes, thiab yeej tsis muaj ib qho human resources function twg muaj.

Where a figure exists it has usually been derived one of three ways: from a vendor's implementation model, from a survey in which staff estimated their own time allocation, or from a count of tickets or transactions that changed definition when the new system was introduced. None of these supports a percentage comparison across time, because the instrument changed at the same moment as the intervention.

There is also a scope question the metric conceals. Transactional work that disappears from the human resources function frequently reappears elsewhere, most often with employees and line managers through self-service. A sixty percent reduction in transactions handled by the function may represent a genuine efficiency gain, a transfer of the same work to people whose time is not being counted, or some combination. Distinguishing these requires measuring total organizational effort, which nobody does, because the metric exists to justify the function's investment rather than to describe the organization's cost.

Kev thov peb: kev nce ntawm cov neeg muaj peev xwm siab tsis tawm haujlwm (high-potential retention)

No yog qhov txaus siab tshaj plaws ntawm plaub qho, vim txoj kev tsim tus lej feem ntau yog qhov kev siv nws tus kheej.

High-potential tsis yog ib qho yam pom tau. Nws yog ib qho chaw uas lub koom haum muab tso rau, thiab ib qho artificial intelligence talent system feem ntau hloov txoj kev muab tso. Ntawd yog lub hom phiaj tau hais. Yog tias tus cuab yeej hloov leej twg raug tso npe ua high-potential, ces cov neeg uas raug ntsuas tom qab kev siv yog ib pab neeg sib txawv ntawm cov neeg uas raug ntsuas ua ntej, thiab ib qho kev sib piv txog kev tsis tawm haujlwm ntawm ob pab no tsis yog ib qho kev sib piv ntawm tib yam.

Txoj kev cuam tshuam uas tshwm sim yeej kwv yees tau. Ib qho qauv uas cim tau qhov muaj peev xwm siab los ntawm keeb kwm kev ua haujlwm, cov cim engagement, thiab kev nce qib haujlwm yuav xaiv tso npe rau cov neeg ua haujlwm uas nkag siab txaus siab, tau nce qib sai sai no, thiab tab tom nce qib, tag nrho ntawm cov no yog cov kev kwv yees zoo tshaj plaws rau kev nyob ntawd. Tus cuab yeej xaiv cov neeg uas twb yuav nyob ntawd lawm thiab lub koom haum sau tseg lawv txoj kev nyob li ib qho tshwm sim ntawm tus cuab yeej.

Qhov loj ntawm pab neeg (cohort size) ua rau qhov no phim ntxiv. Hauv feem ntau lub koom haum cov neeg high-potential me li ces ib qho kev hloov kaum yim feem pua sawv cev rau ob peb tus neeg xwb, uas nyob hauv qhov hloov uas ib pab neeg me li cas tsim tau ib xyoos rau ib xyoos. Ib tus lej ntawm hom no yuav tsum nrog qhov loj ntawm pab neeg thiab seb qhov txhais tau hloov los tsis hloov. Nws yeej tsis muaj kiag li.

Kev thov plaub: kev txo bias

Kev thov plaub txawv ntawm lwm qhov, vim nws tsis yog tsuas yog tsis txhawb tau xwb. Nws yog ib qho kev sawv cev raws kev cai lij choj.

Kev pov thawj rau qhov no yuav tsum ntsuas bias ua ntej thiab tom qab, rau cov pab neeg txhais tseg, nrog cov cell sizes txaus los txhawb kev sib piv. Nws kuj yuav tsum muaj cov pab neeg paub tseeb, uas yog qhov chaw kev thov no feem ntau ua tsis tiav. Kev tsis taus (disability) tsis muaj peev xwm ntsuas li no kiag: cov tswv haujlwm tsis paub thiab tej zaum tsis muaj cai nug ua ntej muaj ib qho kev qhia txaus siab tias leej twg ntawm cov thov ua haujlwm muaj kev tsis taus, yog li tsis muaj ib qho impact-ratio cuab yeej tuaj yeem cim tau kev ntxub ntxaug vim kev tsis taus. Ib lub koom haum uas hais tias kev txo bias hauv kev npaj txoj hauv kev nce qib (succession planning) feem ntau tau ntsuas haiv neeg thiab poj niam txiv neej, yog nws twb tau ntsuas dab tsi lawm, thiab tsis hais dab tsi txog cov neeg cuam tshuam tshaj plaws los ntawm cov qauv siv performance-data.

Succession planning muaj ib qho teeb meem ntxiv. Ib qho qauv uas cim qhov npaj tau lossis muaj peev xwm los ntawm sij hawm ua haujlwm, theem haujlwm, sij hawm hauv txoj haujlwm, sij hawm ntsiab lus tsawg kawg ntawm daim ntawv pov thawj (credential recency), thiab ceev ntawm kev nce qib yav dhau los, tab tom siv cov cim uas muaj kev sib raug zoo heev nrog hnub nyoog. Kev tshaj tawm kev txo bias rau ib qho cuab yeej li no, yam tsis tau tshawb xyuas nws txoj kev faib raws hnub nyoog, yog kev hais qhov sib txawv ntawm qhov cov cim kwv yees.

Thiab tus lej ntawd nws tus kheej tsim kev pheej hmoo. Title VII, raws li tau hloov kho hauv 1991, ua rau nws tsis raug cai los hloov cov qhab nia, siv cov qhab nia txiav txawv, los sis hloov cov ntsiab lus ntawm cov ntsuam xyuas cuam tshuam nrog kev ua haujlwm raws lub hom phiaj ntawm haiv neeg, xim tawv nqaij, kev ntseeg, poj niam txiv neej, los sis lub tebchaws yug los, hauv kev xaiv los sis xa mus rau cov neeg thov ua haujlwm los sis nce qib. Tsis muaj dab tsi ntawm no qhia tias cov cuab yeej no ua li ntawd. Qhov tseem ceeb yog tias ib qho kev tshaj tawm dav dav uas cuam tshuam ib qho cuab yeej nce qib tsis siv neeg nrog cov ntsiab lus demographic yog ib phau ntawv uas lub koom haum tau sau, tsis tuaj yeem thim rov qab, thiab tej zaum yuav raug thov piav qhia.

Yam tsis muaj hauv tag nrho plaub qho

Txhua qho ntawm cov kev ua tsis tiav ua ntej no yog ib qho version ntawm tib qho tsis muaj. Tsis muaj ib qho ntawm cov kev tshawb fawb no muaj ib qho counterfactual, uas yog hais txog ib qho kev piav qhia txog yuav muaj dab tsi tshwm sim yog tsis muaj kev cuam tshuam.

Lub koom haum siv ib qho cuab yeej thaum lub sij hawm uas kev ua haujlwm hloov, tus lej neeg ua haujlwm hloov, cov thawj coj hloov, kev them nyiaj hloov kho, thiab lwm yam kev pib tshiab khiav ua ke. Tom qab ntawd nws muab qhov hloov hauv plaub qho kev ntsuas rau ib qho ntawm cov kev hloov ntawd. Qhov no tsis yog ib qho lus nug me hauv txoj kev tshawb fawb. Nws yog tag nrho lo lus nug, thiab qhov tsis muaj yog qhov ua rau hom kev tshawb fawb no tsis tuaj yeem soj ntsuam tau.

Cov pov thawj tau tshaj tawm txog cov kev thov nyob ib puag ncig yuav tsum ua rau tus neeg yuav khoom xav ntxov. Thaum Harvard Business School thiab Burning Glass Institute tshawb xyuas seb dab tsi tiag tiag tau tshwm sim ntawm cov koom haum uas tau siv lawm skills-based hiring dav dav, lawv pom tias tso tseg cov cai yuav tsum muaj degree hloov kev ntiav cov neeg tsis muaj degree kwv yees li peb thiab li ib nrab feem pua, sawv cev rau tsawg dua ib qho hauv xya pua tus neeg raug ntiav, nrog li ib nrab ntawm cov koom haum tsis muaj kev hloov li cas kiag li txawm lawv tau tshaj tawm lawm los xij. Cov kev tshaj tawm ntawd yog qhov tiag ntawm lub siab. Txoj kev ua tiag tiag txawv tag nrho, thiab cov koom haum uas ua cov ntawd tsis paub.

Kev txiav txim tseem ceeb tsis yog tias cov neeg tab tom dag. Yog tias cov koom haum feem ntau tsis paub seb lawv tus kheej txoj kev pib tshiab ua haujlwm tau los tsis tau, thiab ib qho kev tshawb fawb raug sau los ntawm tus pab uas tsim nyog tsawg tshaj plaws yuav paub qhov tseeb.

Vim li cas tus thov feem ntau ntseeg

Nws tsim nyog hais qhov no ncaj ncaj, vim lwm txoj kev nyeem tsis muaj kev hlub thiab feem ntau tsis raug.

Cov lej no tsawg tsawg raug tsim los ntawm kev dag. Lawv raug tsim los ntawm ib qho ib puag ncig ntsuas uas tsis muaj ib qho hauv paus raug tsa tseg, cov ntsiab lus hloov, tus muag khoom muab txoj kev tshawb fawb, thiab tus neeg sau cov tshwm sim yog tus neeg uas tau txhawb kev yuav khoom. Txhua qho ntawm cov xwm txheej no ua rau qhov tshwm sim mus rau tib sab, thiab tsis muaj ib qho yuav tsum tau leej twg ua tsis

zoo. Tus lej yog qhov tiag hauv qhov txhais tias muaj ib tus neeg xam nws. Nws tsuas yog tsis txhais raws li kab lus nyob ib puag ncig nws hais.

Qhov no kuj yog vim li cas ib puag ncig kev tswj hwm tau pib txav. Federal Trade Commission tau ua haujlwm tawm tsam cov kev thov txog artificial intelligence capability uas tsis muaj kev txhawb, suav nrog ib qho kev txiav txim thaum lub Ib Hlis 2025 uas yuav tsum tus muag software accessibility them ib plhom nyiaj vim nws tau hais tias nws tus khoom automated tuaj yeem coj txhua lub website mus raws li cov qauv accessibility. Qhov ncaj ncees no tsis tsuas yog rau hom khoom ntawd xwb. Cov kev thov ntawm kev ua tau zoo txog artificial intelligence yuav tsum muaj kev txhawb, thiab ib lub koom haum tshaj tawm cov feem pua ntawm tshwm sim hauv ib phau ntawv qhia txaus siab yog kev thov ntawm hom kev thov hom no.

Yam ib tus neeg yuav khoom yuav tsum nug

Plaub lo lus nug, uas siv kwv yees kaum feeb thiab uas feem ntau ntau ntawm cov kev tshawb fawb tsis tuaj yeem dhau.

Qhov hauv paus yog dab tsi, thaum twg raug ntsuas, thiab los ntawm leej twg. Yog qhov hauv paus tau raug tsim tom qab kev siv, los sis muab los ntawm tus muag khoom, qhov kev sib piv tsis yog qhov sib piv tiag.

Qhov txhais puas hloov. Rau ib qho kev ntsuas twg cuam tshuam nrog ib pab neeg raug txhais tseg, xws li high-potential los sis key roles, nug seb cov cai txhais puas zoo ib yam ua ntej thiab tom qab. Yog tus cuab yeej hloov lawv, cov pab neeg txawv thiab qhov sib piv tsis raug siv.

Dab tsi tseem hloov thaum lub sij hawm ntawd. Kev ua haujlwm, tus lej neeg ua haujlwm, kev them nyiaj, kev tswj hwm, lwm yam kev pib tshiab khiav ua ke. Ib tus neeg teb ncaj ncees yuav muaj ib daim ntawv teev npe. Ib tus neeg teb uas tsis muaj tsis tau saib xyuas.

Tus lej hauv qab yog dab tsi, thiab muaj pes tsawg tus neeg. Cov feem pua yam tsis muaj qhov loj ntawm pab neeg tsis muaj kev txhais tau, thiab cov pab neeg me tsim cov feem pua loj los ntawm cov kev hloov me me.

> **LO LUS NUG THIB TSIB**
>
> Lo lus nug thib tsib yog qhov tsim nyog nug rau txhua qhov kev thov uas hais txog kev tsis ncaj ncees: pab pawg twg raug ntsuas, ntawm qhov loj me twg, thiab dab tsi tau ua rau cov pab pawg uas ntsuas tsis tau. Cov lus teb rau feem kawg feem ntau yog tsis muaj dab tsi tau ua, thiab qhov ntawd yeej yog qhov tseem ceeb tshaj plaws uas tus yuav khoom yuav kawm tau.

Yam uas ib qho kev tshawb fawb (case study) muaj ntseeg tau yuav tsim nyog muaj

Hom ntawv no tsis yog ib yam uas kho tsis tau lawm, thiab ib lub koom haum uas kam tshaj tawm cov ntsiab lus hauv qab no yuav sib txawv tam sim ntawd hauv ib thaj chaw uas tsis muaj leej twg ua li ntawd.

Qhia qhov chaw pib (baseline) thiab hnub tim ntawm nws. Qhia cov ntsiab lus txhais thiab sau tseg txog qhov twg tau hloov. Qhia cov pawg ntawv (cohort) qhov loj me nrog rau feem pua. Qhia cov kev hloov pauv uas tshwm sim tib lub sijhawm uas yuav ua rau muaj kev hloov, thiab qhia tias yam twg koj tsis muaj peev xwm lees tawm tau. Piav qhia txog yam uas ua tsis tau zoo, vim tias qhov kev siv uas txhua yam zoo tuaj yeej yog qhov kev siv uas tsis muaj dab tsi raug ntsuas. Thiab thaum muaj kev thov txog kev tsis ncaj ncees, qhia cov pawg neeg, txoj kev ua, cov pawg loj me, thiab yam twg tseem tsis tau ntsuas.

Daim ntawv ntawd tsis zoo nkauj npaum li tus qauv niaj hnub no thiab muaj txiaj ntsig ntau dua. Nws kuj yog tib qho version uas ciaj tau thaum leej twg uas xav paub tias nws puas muaj tseeb los nyeem.

Kev xaus

Qhov kev tshawb fawb (case study) yog cov pov thawj tseem ceeb tshaj plaws hauv kev yuav khoom siv thev naus laus zis rau haujlwm neeg (human resources technology) hauv cov tuam txhab loj, thiab nws yog hom pov thawj tsawg tshaj plaws uas siv tau nyob rau hauv kev ua haujlwm niaj hnub. Nws yog los ntawm ib lub koom haum xwb, tsis muaj kev tswj hwm, tus kheej qhia tawm, txhais dua tom qab, thiab tshaj tawm los ntawm ib tog uas muaj kev txaus siab rau qhov kev pom ntawd.

None of that makes it worthless. It makes it a hypothesis. The organizations that will actually realize returns from these systems are the ones that treat other people's numbers as a reason to investigate rather than a reason to buy, and that hold their own numbers to the standard they would want applied to a vendor's. The discipline is not difficult and it is not expensive. It is a baseline, a stable definition, a cohort size, and an honest account of what else was happening at the time.

Cov chaw siv

- Federal Trade Commission, *In the Matter of accessiBe, Inc.*, File No. 2223156, daim ntawv foob thiab daim ntawv thov txiav txim tshaj tawm rau lub Ib Hlis 3, 2025.
- Fuller, Joseph, et al. *Skills-Based Hiring: The Long Road from Pronouncements to Practice*. Harvard Business School Project on Managing the Future of Work thiab The Burning Glass Institute, Lub Ob Hlis 2024.
- Title VII ntawm Civil Rights Act of 1964, raws li tau hloov kho, 42 U.S.C. § 2000e-2, suav nrog § 2000e-2(l).
- Uniform Guidelines on Employee Selection Procedures, 29 C.F.R. Part 1607, siv tau rau cov txheej txheem xaiv neeg uas cuam tshuam txog kev ntiav haujlwm, kev nce haujlwm, thiab lwm yam sib hais txog haujlwm.

TIPS

Know something about a sign language AI system that the public should know? Send it to tips@novaracg.com. Every tip is read by me and kept confidential. If you work in the UK, writing to us is not by itself a protected disclosure under the Public Interest Disclosure Act 1998, so before you share employer information, check your options with Protect (protect-advice.org.uk), the free whistleblowing advice line.

Yuav Hais Qhov Chaw Li Cas

Grizzle, H. M. (2025, May 23). Plaub Xoom Thiab Tsis Muaj Kev Sib Piv: Kev Nyeem Zaj Kawm Txog Artificial Intelligence Hauv Human Resources. Novara Consulting Group. https://www.novaracg.com/hmn/2025/05/23/four-numbers-and-no-counterfactual-reading-the-artificial-intelligence-case-study-in-human-resources/